Human Development in Maharashtra:

Changes, Present Status and Policies for Bridging Social Gaps

By

Sukhadeo Thorat

Professor, Jawaharlal Nehru University
Chairman, Indian Council of Social Sciences Research
Managing Trustee, Indian Institute of Dalit Studies
New Delhi

Goals of Development

- Human Development, From Growth to Human Poverty - Evolution of the concept
- Increase income in general and of poor
- Lower poverty, Low malnutrition
- Improvement in health, access to school and higher education, skill development
- Basic amenities- water, electricity, sanitation and housing
- Elimination of discrimination,-civic, political and economic rights

Presentation Scheme

Progress in human development - 1993 to 2012

Current status in 2012

Causes of low human development and continuing social gap

Issues for Government policy

Suggest policy measures for minimising Social gaps

Based on Official Data

Some features of the State

Population and Urbanization

Population in Maharashtra (%)- 2011

Social Groups	Share of Population
SC	11.8
ST	9.4
Others	78.8
All	100

Source: Census of India, 2011

According to the NSS, population of OBC is about 35% in 2011.

Population and Share of SCs, Buddhist and Combined SC and Buddhist Population- 1951 to 2011

	Population (In Million)				Population	ı (%)	
Year	SC	Buddhist	SC+ Buddhist	Total	SC	Buddhist	SC+ Buddhist
1951	3.9	0.0	3.9	31.7	12.4	0.0	12.4
1961	2.2	2.8	5.0	39.6	5.6	7.1	12.7
1971	3.0	3.3	6.3	50.4	6.0	6.5	12.5
1981	4.5	3.9	8.4	62.8	7.1	6.3	13.4
1991	8.8	5.0	13.8	78.9	11.1	6.4	17.5
2001	9.9	5.8	15.7	96.9	10.2	6.0	16.2
2011	13.3	NA	NA	112.4	11.8	NA	NA

Source: Census of India (Various Years)

Population by Religious Groups (%): 2001

Religions	Population Share
Hindu	80.4
Muslim	10.6
Buddhist	6.0
Christian	1.1
Sikhs	0.2
Jains	1.3
Others	0.2
Religion not Stated	0.1
All	100

Source: Census of India, 2011

Share of Population and Share of Poor- 2012

Social Group	Share of Population		Share of Poor			
	Rural	Urban	Total	Rural	Urban	Total
Non-Muslim ST	13.36	3.64	8.91	34.03	9.03	28.00
Non-Muslim SC	13.93	16.91	15.29	13.69	29.60	17.53
Non-Muslim OBC	37.04	25.97	31.98	27.51	21.61	26.09
Non-Muslim Others	30.74	37.72	33.94	18.95	12.79	17.46
Muslim	4.93	15.76	9.89	5.82	26.97	10.92
Total	100	100	100	100	100	100

Source: NSS 2011-12

Urbanisation-

Population Share in Rural and Urban Areas- 2011

Social Groups	Rural	Urban	Total
SC	56.5	43.5	100
ST	85.7	14.3	100
Others	50.9	49.1	100
All	54.8	45.2	100

Source: Census of India, 2011

Progress:1960 onward

Five Indicators:

- Income
- Poverty
- Malnutrition
- Education
- Civic Amenities

Positive changes

- Per capita income increased
- Poverty and malnutrition reduced,
- Literacy rate improved ,
- Enrolment rate in higher education reduced,
- Urbanization increased ,employment and regular salaried job increased
- Access to amenities increased
- Access to dalit to public places ahs improved

Changes in Poverty

Cocial	To	tal	Ru	ral	Urban	
Social Groups	1993- 12	2004- 12	1993- 12	2004- 12	1993- 12	2004- 12
ST	-1.25	-1.47	-0.87	-0.94	-3.08	-2.52
SC	-3.68	-7.00	-3.57	-7.20	-3.55	-6.02
OBC	NA	-6.53	NA	-5.90	NA	-7.37
Others	NA	-6.31	NA	- 4.57	NA	-8.19
Non-SC/ST	-3.72	-6.35	-3.55	-5.31	-3.85	-7.78
Total	-3.39	-5.68	-3.12	-4.74	-3.69	-7.06

Source: NSS 1993/94, 2004/05 and 2011/12

Changes in Poverty by Occupation Group-Rural- 1993-12

Household Type	ST	SC	Non-SC/ST	All
Self-employed in Non-agriculture	2.40	-3.50	-3.61	-3.10
Agriculture Labour	-1.18	-3.01	-2.92	-2.56
Other Labour	1.27	-4.05	-2.66	-1.93
Self-employed in Agriculture	-2.64	- 4.45	-3.83	-3.82
Other Household Type	2.30	-3.84	-4.02	-2.85

Source: NSS 1993/94 and 2011/12

Changes in Poverty by Occupation Group-Urban - 1993-12

Household Type	ST	SC	Non-SC/ST	All
Regular Wage Salaried	-3.16	-3.86	-4.01	-3.96
Self-employed	-3.68	-4.17	-4.33	-4.19
Causal Labour	-1.63	-2.90	-2.94	-2.81
Other Household Type	-5.26	-1.82	-4.34	-4.01

Source: NSS 1993/94 and 2011/12

Changes in Underweight- Total

Social Groups	1992 to 2006	1998 to 2006
SC	-1.2	-0.2
ST	-1.1	-1.8
OBC	NA	-3.3
Others	NA	-3.0
Non-SC/STs	-2.2	-3.0
All	-1.7	-0.8

Source: NFHS I, II and III

Changes in Unemployment Rate (CDS)-1993 to 2012

Social Groups	Total	Rural	Urban
ST	4.8	1.9	4.1
SC	0.3	-1.8	-1.1
OBC	NA	NA	NA
Others	NA	NA	NA
Non-SC/ST	-1.4	-3.2	-1.8
Total	-0.6	-2.1	-1.8

Source: NSS 1993/94 and 2011/12

Present Situation in 2012:

Challenges before Us

Poverty and malnutrition is high,

Disparities between groups persists

Access to amenities is low, Caste Discrimination persists

Per Capita Income-(MPCE) - 2012 (in Rs)

Groups	Total	Rural	Urban
ST	406	340	688
SC	613	504	718
OBC	677	522	918
Others	919	601	1178
All	743	522	1005

Source: NSS 2011/12

Note: MPCE is estimated at 1999-00 constant prices.

- Per capita increased at per annum rate of 1.95% total, 1.79% rural and 1.66% urban during 1993-2012.
- Average MPCE is Rs. 743 in Maharashtra for 2012.
- The lowest average MPCE was Rs. 406 for STs and Rs. 613 among SCs, followed by Rs. 677 for OBCs and highest was Rs. 919 for Others.

Contd...

Poverty - 2012

Groups	Total	Rural	Urban
ST	54.4	61.6	23.3
SC	19.7	23.8	15.8
OBC	14.5	18.2	8.7
Others	10.7	16.5	6.0
All	17.3	24.2	9.1

Source: NSS, 2011-12

Poverty reduced from 48.7 % to 17.3% during 1993-2012 Most poor are ST and SC, compared with OBC and others –caste system is reflected in poverty

Poverty across Regions - 2012

Regions	Rural	Urban	Total
Konkan	35.4	1.9	9.2
Western Maharashtra	10.2	8.1	9.4
Northern Maharashtra	33.4	20.5	28.7
Marathwada	22.4	21.1	22.0
Nagpur	28.4	20.3	25.6
Chandrapur-Bhandara	37.7	11.6	32.7
Maharashtra	24.2	9.1	17.3

Source: NSS 2011-12

Malnutrition-

Underweight Children below 3 years – -2006

Social Groups	Total	Rural	Urban
SC	48.9	57.1	44.2
ST	55.0	62.0	44.2
OBC	36.2	33.9	37.5
Others	34.6	37.4	33.3
All	39.6	35.9	34.9

Source: IIPS, 2005-06

The sever underweight is 15.2 % for SCs, 20.6 % for STs as compared to around 9 % among OBCs and Others.

Under Five Child Mortality- Total - 2006

Social Groups	Mortality Rate
SC	50
ST	70
OBC	58
Others	47
All	53

Source: IIPS, 2005-06

Civic Amenities –Household without facilities - Rural (figure %)- 2011

Types	ST	SC	Others	Total
No Drinking Water Facility	76.64	63.07	52.06	57.10
No Latrine Facility	78.91	67.40	57.60	62.0
No Electricity Facility	49.85	32.27	20.33	26.2
Living in Congested houses (In Million)	0.57	0.49	2.40	3.47
Total Housing Shortage (In Million)	42.7 (0.80)	34·9 (0.62)	31.8 (2.98)	34.0 (4.42)

Source: Census of India, 2011.

Note: Housing shortage is measured by taking temporary/katcha houses, living in obsolescent houses and congested houses (requiring new houses)

Civic Amenities – Households without facilities in Urban (figures %)- 2011

Types	ST	SC	Others	Total
No Drinking Water Facility	31.65	28.81	18.67	20.80
No Latrine Facility	40.60	41.34	25.69	28.70
No Electricity Facility	8.84	6.31	3.03	3.80
Living in Congested houses (In Million)	0.19	0.61	2.43	3.21
Total Housing Shortage (In Million)	36.6 (0.21)	41.7 (0.64)	31.1 (2.71)	32.7 (3.54)

Source: Census of India, 2011.

Note: Housing shortage is measured by taking temporary/katcha houses, living in obsolescent houses and congested houses (requiring new houses)

Housing condition in Rural area among Poor Households (figures %) - 2009-NSS

Facilities and Condition in the house	ST	SC	ОВС	Others	Total
No Facility of Drinking Water	78.1	71.4	59.5	62.5	66.8
No Latrine Facility	82.4	86.8	78.4	78.8	81.1
No Electricity	38.6	29.0	18.3	15.4	24.3
Katcha Roof Type House	11.3	7.3	8.2	5.3	8.0
Inadequate or No Drainage arrangement	77.2	78.4	64.2	68.6	71.1

Source: NSS, 2008-09.

Housing condition in Urban for Poor Households (%) – 2009-NSS

Facilities and Condition in the house	ST	SC	ОВС	Others	Total
No Facility of Drinking Water	48.7	47.0	34.1	38.3	39.6
No Latrine Facility	54.4	72.9	53.6	48.0	55.9
No Electricity	6.1	6.0	5.3	4.8	5.3
Katcha Roof Type House	4.1	5.3	4.9	2.5	4.0
Inadequate or No Drainage arrangement	41.1	38.6	27.4	25.8	30.3

Source: NSS, 2008-09.

Reasons for Gap in Human Development among social groups

State Level Group wise Picture

Reasons for Poverty

- Landlessness
- Low ownership of private enterprise
- High dependence on wage labour
- High unemployment rate
- Low access to vocational and professional education
- Low access to civic amenities
- Caste discrimination in employment and other market and in other spheres

Source of Livelihood Agricuktural Land Ownership

Indicators	ST	SC	OBC	Others	All
Self employed in Agriculture – 2012 (%)	39.5	27.8	47.9	50.4	44.7
Land Owned- 2003 (%)	77.6	82.5	89.5	88.3	86.2
Landless- 2003 (%)	22.4	17.5	10.5	11.7	14
Marginal Farmers-2003 (%)	53.7	67.7	53.7	53.7	56
Average land size -2003 (Hectare)	0.76	0.42	1.20	1.38	1.07
Average land size for Marginal- 2003 (Hectare)	0.22	0.13	0.24	0.33	0.25

Source: NSS 2011-12 and NSS 2002-03

Private Non-agricultural Enterprise

Indicators	ST	SC	OBC	Others	All
Self employed in Non- agriculture (Rural) -2012	3.5	7.9	11.7	12.2	10.2
Self employed in urban areas- 2012	22.2	26.1	37.6	41.9	37.3
Private Enterprises- Total- 2005	8.1	5.0	27.0	59.9	100
MSME- Total- 2007	5.6	1.7	13.8	78.8	100

Source: NSS 2011-12, 5th economic census and NSS 2006-07

High Level of Wage Labour- 2010

Social	Rural		Urban
Groups	Farm	Non-farm	Casual Labour
ST	41.1	10.7 (52%)	18.0
SC	46.8	10.6 (57%)	15.5
OBC	24.2	6.1 (30%)	8.3
Others	22.4	2.2 (24%)	5.9
Total	29.2	6.0 (31%)	8.6

Source: NSS 2011-12

Unemployment Rate (CDS) for age group 15-59 years - 2010

Social Groups	Total	Rural	Urban
ST	9.3	6.2	8.9
SC	13.1	6.7	10.5
OBC	6.6	6.5	6.6
Others	3.5	5.0	4.3
Total	7.0	5.7	6.5

Source: NSS 2009-10

High unemployment among SCs

- -age group 15-29 years- 15.7% and
- -educated upto graduate and above- 12.4%

Factors for Disparities cont –

Enrollment Ratio by Educational Levels- 2008

Social Groups	Primary and Middle	Secondary and Higher Secondary	Higher Education
ST	89.42	52.27	8.80
SC	98.67	67.94	22.74
OBC	99.84	73.12	18.05
Others	100.39	72.32	29.39
Total	98.91	70.08	23.01

Source: NSS, 2007-08

Education Contd...

% share of Total Students in Higher Education-2008

Social Groups	Govt, Local Body and Private Aided	Private Unaided
ST	76.6	23.4?
SC	85.8	14.2
OBC	83.6	16.4
Others	72.6	27.4
Total	77.4	22.6

Source: NSS 2007-08

Factors for Disparities cont --

Growth less pro-poor for Wage labor and SC/ST as a factor

Factor for Disparities –

Relative Elasticity of Reduction in Poverty with respect to MPCE - 1993/94 to 2009/10

Social Group	Rural	Urban	Total
ST	2.2	0.7	1.4
SC	1.8	0.8	1.0
Others*	2.4	0.9	1.1
Total	2.3	0.9	1.1

Source: NSS 19993/94 and 2004/05

Factors for Disparities cont –

Income Inequalities – Gini Ratio

Year	Rural	Urban	Total
1993-94	0.265	0.335	0.348
2004-05	0.287	0.370	0.372
2011-12	0.259	0.368	0.363

Source: NSS 19993/94, 2004/05 and 2011/12

Share of Income by Quintile-2012

Quintile	Total	Rural	Urban
0-20	10.4	7.7	8.7
20-40	14.4	11.4	12.6
40-60	17.2	15.0	15.8
60-80	21.6	20.6	21.0
80-100	36.3	45.3	41.9
Total	100	100	100

Source: NSS 2011-12

Factors for Disparities-

Discrimination

- Economic Discrimination
 - Markets –Employment by private sector
 - Other market –Farmers
 - Input for agriculture
- Sale of Produce
- Government schemes –food, nutrition ,health
- Civic amenities
- Social PCR and Atrocities

Share in employees by caste of owners and employees in MSME in Maharashtra- 2007

Owners' social		Social group of employee				
group	SC	ST	OBC	Others	Total	
SC	24.6	6.1	17.2	52.1	100	
ST	14.5	13.2	15.6	56.7	100	
OBC	11.5	6.3	40.7	41.5	100	
Others	8.3	3.9	15.3	72.5	100	
Total	9.5	4.4	17.4	68.7	100	

Source: Registered MSME, 2006-07

Factors of Disparity cont

Government schemes

- Food Fair prices shops (PDS)
- **Nutrition** Mid Day Meal, Anganwadi
- Health JSY

Government Institutions Action Aid Study- 2000

Indira Awas Yojana

- Residential segregation of Dalit families as they are allocated and sanctioned houses in cluster
- Residential segregation also affects access to basic civil, social, educational and cultural amenities

Public Distribution System

- No entry in PDS shop for Dalits (10 per cent villages)
- The practice of purity and pollution by avoiding touching the lower caste Dalits while exchanging goods and services was found in one village of Latur District

Post Office

- Absence of untochability practice in post offices
- But, it did observed in the case of delivery of letters by the postman in 11 per cent villages of three regions

Public Health Centers (PHCs)

- Dalits had access to both PHCs and Doctor's services
- However, Dalits have to face differential treatment and attitudinal negligence
- Preferential treatment to the member of higher caste community
- No existence of health workers in Dalit Locality

Visit by Government Health workers

- Untochability practiced in 3 villages in western region, 1 in Marathwada and 2 in Vidarbha
- The health personnel do not visit Dalit
 Colonies
- Even if they visit the colony, they did not treat Dalits; and
- Not giving medicines to Dalits meant for them

Public Transport Services

 Higher caste population maintain their distance from Dalits, both in queues and also in seating in some cases

Panchayat Office

- No consultation with the Dalit members while taking the decisions
- Different seating arrangement for Dalits and also they are made to sit on the floor

Schools

- Different seating arrangement for both Dalit
 Students and teachers
- Girl children are not allowed to talk with Dalit student and visit Dalit colony

MDM

 The high caste Angawadi worker distribute food differently to Dalit children with high quality and more quantity of food to the high caste children

Market

- Separate shops for Dalit and High caste customers
- Dalits being not able to sell their milk produce, discrimination in restaurants
- differentiated in hiring for agricultural (20 per cent of the villages) and construction (19 per cent of the villages) jobs

Common Spheres

Water sources-

- Denial of access to water sources (33 per cent of the villages)
- In the remaining villages surveyed, it exist in different form with having to wait, vacation of the well, not touching the vessels of higher caste etc.

Common Sphere Cont...

Temple

 Temple entry was denied to Dalits (50 per cent of the villages)

Other common spheres

- Separate cremation grounds for Dalits (30 per cent of the villages)
- Restricting access to grazing lands, fishing and irrigational facilities
- In SHGs, maintaining physical distance, refusal of membership and passing casteist remarks
- Separate community centers for Dalits

Disparities Cont---

 Lack of Freedom – Civic, Social Political and Religious right

- Untouchability and Atrocities
 - PCR Act 1976 and
 - Atrocity Act 1989

Cases of Untouchability and Atrocities-Maharashtra

	SC (1995-2011)			ST (2001-2012)		
Crimes	Total Crimes	Average	Crimes 2012		Annual Average	
Total	15900	935	1091	3100	258	308
PCR	1763	104	5	1	0	1
PoA	4256	250	267	601	50	53

PCR Crimes- Crimes registered under the Protection of Civil Rights Act, 1976 PoA Crimes- Crimes registered under the Prevention of Atrocities Act 1989

Source: Crime in India, National Crime Bureau Record, GOI, New Delhi.

Disposal of Crimes - 2012

Social Groups	Pendency Rate	Conviction Rate
SC	89.6	5.4
ST	89.8	8.1

Source: Crime in India, National Crime Bureau Record, GOI, New Delhi

Caste and Untouchability through Primary Survey

- 1958 Gokhale Instute Survey- Wai Taluk
- 1962- Gokhale Instute Survey- 25 village in Nashik and Buldhana District
- 1972- Harijan Sevak Sangh- 192 villages covering all parts of maharashtra
- 1977- Harijan Sevak Sangh and G I 204 villages and 4476 families
- 1991- Social Work College, Bombay, Marathwada 95 village
- 2000- Action Aid- 50 Villages in all over Maharashtra

Primary Survey Continue...

- Three **Observation** about change
 - Spheres not much changed- marriage, housing, personal home
 - Change with differential treatment- Public place, road, tap water, temple, panchayat
 - Change with minimum, discrimination or no discrimination- post office, bus, court, police station

Proposed

Policies and Strategies

for Bridging the Social Gap

Strategies

• **Growth**, But Inclusive, productivity and income enhancing – small farmers and producers

• **Redistributive** – Assets ,income, employment, education, health and foods

Socially Inclusive Growth Strategies

- Make growth pro-poor
- Income of wage labour, poor small farmers petty non farm producer
- Increase in employment,
- Education and skill
- Focus on SC/ST farmers
- Non-discriminatory growth

Small Farm Focus

- All Farmers- Credit, input and extension, irrigation and marketing at ruminative prices
- SC Farmers- Credit, input, extension, irrigation and marketing at ruminative prices
- **Procurement policy** for vegetable, fruits, and milk
- **ST Farmers-** Technology, tree, fruits, flower, livestock, grazing land

Use of NREGA

- Irrigation private, drainage, land leveling
- Watershed
- Agro-climatic zone and watershed
- Particularly on SC, ST, OBC farms

Private Non farm enterprise

- Improving private ownership for SCs/STs licensing, land , capital, services
- Modernize the private sector of SC/STs
- Affirmative Action Policy by private sector
- Increase in the equity (share) in the private sector
 - -will enhance Participation in corporate governance and share in income,
 - -Procurement by State and Private Sector
 - -Equal opportunity Office for AAP

Redistributive -Increase ownership of Land

Landless is high among SCs

- Distribution of Public Land
- Develop cultural waste land and distribute to SC who are more landless than others
- Ownership right of land which is being cultivated

Employment

Growth with Employment-

- Increase in the salaried employment
- Vocational skill to casual labour families
- Vocational and professional
- Financial support for private sector education

Affirmative Action in Private Sector

- Affirmative action 4 E's
- Increase coverage for signing code of AAA (only 12% signed)
- Affirmative action in hiring
- Improve recruitment mechanism
- Education Recruitment Commision for School and Higher Educational Institutions
- Equal Opportunity Office- Monitoring

Social Needs:

Education, Water, Housing, Latrine and **Electricity**

Education

- Drop out at school and secondary levels
- Resume regular examination
- Residential Hostel on large scale
- Withdraw Self-financing Act for Schools, Act
 2013
- Three Language formula- English from 5th

Education contd...

Higher Education

- Strengthen public institutions, universities and colleges. Encourage private aided
- Financial support to poor families in private aided
- Much low admission in Private aided

Water, Latrine, Electricity, and Housing

- 77 % of ST, 63% SC households needs drinking facilities
- 79% ST, and 76% of SC households need latrine at home
- 50% of STs and 32% of SCs need electricity connection at home
- 43% of rural STs, and 35% of rural SCs need proper housing, and 36% urban STs and 43% urban SCs need proper housing.
- Use SCP and TSP

Strategy to overcome discrimination

Government Schemes

- Ownership of dealers, PDS
- Employment of SC/ST/Muslim as ASHA, Anganwadi worker and cook in
- Administrative guideline for non-discrimination, Legal safeguards against discrimination

Overcome Discrimination in Public Places

- Enforcement of PCR and Atrocity Act
- Institution of Justice- more participation of Dalits and Adivasi Judges
- Positive civic education on caste through Panchayat
- Separate department for caste reform in Ministry of Social Welfare

Reform of Reservation Policy in Politics

- Reform of present electoral methods to have independent and genuine representation
- Modified form of Separate Electorate System of Election
- Correction of population of SCs in the State to overcome under representation

OBC and Muslim

Specific problems of OBCs-

- Child Mortality,
- Higher Education

Muslim-

- High urban poverty
- Self-employed
- Regular Salaried
- Education and Skill

Women

Education in Rural areas- SC/ST/OBC

• Health, discriminatory access- institutional delivery

• Devdasi, Jogini System

Budget Allocation and Flow to SCSP and TSP in Maharashtra- 2009 to 2014

Year	Budget Allocation in Rs. Lakh@			Share to State Budget (%)	
	State Plan	TSP	SCSP	TSP	SCSP
2009-10	3785363	205209	265234	5.42	7.01
2010-11	3323550	279354	346102	7.38	9.14
2011-12	4150000	324486	423300	8.57	11.18
2012-13	4500000	350599	459000	9.26	12.13
2013-14	4900000	381734	499768	10.08	13.20
2014-15	5122254	421501	604426	11.14	15.97

Source: http://mahades.maharashtra.gov.in

Note: 1. @ Includes both budge for State and Districts

2. TSP and SCSP indicates Tribal Sub Plan and Scheduled Caste Sub Plan

Present Government Schemes in Maharashtra

Area	Schemes for
Education- School, Technical and Higher Education	Fee and exam fee waive, scholarship, school dress, book bank, maintenance allowance, Ashram School, Hostel construction and extention for weaker sections including engaged in unclean occupations and particularly for girls and etc.
Economic Development	Self employment, village development and water conservation, Cooperative Institutions/industries
Housing and basic Amenities	Housing, Water and Sanitation, Dalit Vasti and City Dalit Locality development, slum improvement programme

Scheme Cont...

Area	Schemes for
Women and Child development	Nutrition, Education support, Devdasi rehabilitation and empowerment,
Nutrition	ICDS, special nutrition programme for unclean localities
Agriculture	Land Distribution, Crop Conservation, Gaothan extention, livestock conservation, drip irrigation,
Industry	Financial and input support, Entrepreneur training,

Scheme Cont...

Area	Schemes for
Labour Welfare	Establishing training institutes, book bank, tool kits, training
Untouchability Eradication Programme	Essay writing, speech competition, prize to villages working for Dalit localities, seminar, celebration of untouchability eradication

Thank You